# United States v. American Eel Depot, et al., 22-cr-165-JMV

Att. **B** to Gov't Opp. to Mot. to Dism.

DEPARTMENT OF THE INTERIOR REPORT OF INVESTIGATION U.S. FISH AND WILDLIFE SERVICE REPORT#: 2015501394R011 OFFICE OF LAW ENFORCEMENT APPROVED Note: This document contains neither recommendations nor conclusions of the Office of Law Enforcement, U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service. It is the property of this office and is loaned to your agency. It, and its contents are not to be distributed outside of your agency. CASE TITLE CASE NUMBER REPORT DATE 03/07/2017 2015501394 AMERICAN EEL DEPOT REPORTING OFFICER CASE STATUS SENSITIVE CASE **PENDING** Amy Snyder -APPROVED BY Preston Fant, Jeffrey Odom, Amy Snyder, SUBJECTS OF REPORT AED TRADING ASIA AQUATIC COMPANY LTD.
YI RUI HUANG - AMERICAN EEL DEPOT CORPORATION
YI RUI HUANG - CHANGLE PACIFIC FOOD CORP.

### SYNOPSIS

CHAO JIN SHI - OCEAN GREAT LLC.

This report documents an illegal importation of eel meat containing Convention on International Trade in Endangered Species of Wild Fauna and Flora (CITES) Appendix II protected European eels (Anguilla anguilla) into the United States by AMERICAN EEL DEPOT CORPORATION (AED).

<u>DISTRIBUTION</u> Internal List

# REPORT OF INVESTIGATION Title: AMERICAN EEL DEPOT

# **Report #: 011**

INV #: 2015501394

# **DETAILS OF INVESTIGATION**

# AED Importation Intercepted at the Elizabeth, NJ Seaport

On October 20, 2016, United States Fish and Wildlife Service (Service) Senior Special Agent Philip Alegranti identified a 40 foot ocean container manifested as "frozen roasted eel" destined for AED's headquarters in New Jersey, from CHANGLE PACIFIC FOOD CORP. (CP) in China. On October 25, 2016, this shipment made import at the Elizabeth, NJ seaport in container number YMLU5403825.

On November 2, 2016, this shipment became available for inspection at East Coast Warehouse and Service Wildlife Inspector (WI) Kathleen Bushman and Service Special Agent (SA) Amy Snyder inspected this shipment. No import paperwork such as packing lists, invoices, or CITES permits accompanied this shipment, and neither the Service, nor U.S. Customs and Border Protection (CBP), nor the warehouse, had any import paperwork for this shipment.

According to the physical inspection and records later provided by AED representatives, the shipment contained 2,100 cartons/boxes. During the inspection, SA Snyder and WI Bushman took inventory of the boxes' labels to identify patterns within the shipment, and establish a sampling plan. In examining the boxes, WI Bushman and SA Snyder determined that each box was labeled with a box number, and a twenty digit lot/batch number. There was a total of five different lot numbers represented in this shipment. These lot numbers are believed to begin with the date of manufacture, and include the registration number of the Chinese eel farm. For instance, the lot number 160622013500M0578043 would show that this carton of eels was manufactured on June 22, 2016, and related to Chinese eel farm 3500M0578.

The lot numbers represented in the October 25, 2016 import were as follows:

160622013500M0578040 160622013500M0578043 160626013500M0578047 160627013500M0578048 160628013500M0578049

Within these lot numbers, SA Snyder and WI Bushman recorded the sizes of imported filets as follows:

160622013500M0578040 contained 9 ounce eel filets 160622013500M0578043 contained 9 ounce eel filets

Page 2 of 16

INV #: 2015501394

**Report #: 011** 

# REPORT OF INVESTIGATION Title: AMERICAN EEL DEPOT

160626013500M0578047 contained 9 ounce eel filets 160627013500M0578048 contained 9 ounce eel filets and 10 ounce eel filets 160628013500M0578049 contained 6 ounce eel filets and 10 ounce eel filets

Each of the 2,100 boxes contained two smaller cases. Inside each of these cases were 16 vacuum packed frozen eel filets, for a total of approximately 32 filets per box in the shipment. The boxes, cartons, and vacuum packed filets were all labeled generically as "eel" and did not offer any scientific or common names for species.

# IMG 0740.JPG:



Page 3 of 16

INV #: 2015501394

**Report #: 011** 

# REPORT OF INVESTIGATION Title: AMERICAN EEL DEPOT

As such, SA Snyder and WI Bushmen removed the following fourteen (14) representative samples of eel meat under Seizure Tag #851358:

Item #1 removed from lot #160622013500M0578043, box #0278: Two (2) nine ounce eel filets, one from each of the two inner cases

Item #2 removed from lot #160622013500M0578040, box #0151: Two (2) nine ounce eel filets, one from each of the two inner cases

Item #3 removed from lot #160626013500M0578047, box #0681: Two (2) nine ounce eel filets, one from each of the two inner cases

Item #4 removed from lot #160627013500M0578048, box #1026: Two (2) nine ounce eel filets, one from each of the two inner cases

Item #5 removed from lot #160627013500M0578048, box #1543: Two (2) ten ounce eel filets, one from each of the two inner cases

Item #6 removed from lot #160628013500M0578049, box #1595: Two (2) ten ounce eel filets, one from each of the two inner cases

Item #7 removed from lot #160628013500M0578049, box #2015: Two (2) six ounce eel filets, one from each of the two inner cases

SA Snyder and WI Bushman then taped the boxes shut with Service inspection tape and left a property receipt in box #0681 denoting which items had been sampled (See attachment #1; AED Property Receipt).

# Eel Samples Shipped to the Service's National Wildlife Forensics Laboratory (NWFL)

On November 2, 2016, Service SA LeeAnn Bies shipped all fourteen (14) packages of eel filets to the NWFL for species identification (See attachment #2; NWFL Evidence Submittal Form).

# Contacts with GLONEX USA LTD. (GLONEX)

On November 10, 2016, WI Daniel Sahakian answered a phone call at the front desk from a GLONEX employee inquiring about the aforementioned container of eel meat, being held by the Service. After this initial call, all subsequent communications with GLONEX, were between WI Sahakian and Joo Youn KO, aka Julie KO (See attachment #3; Sahakian 3-332). (SA's note:

Page 11 of 16

# REPORT OF INVESTIGATION Title: AMERICAN EEL DEPOT

Until this import, SA Snyder had not seen GLONEX affiliated with the processed eel meat portion of AED's business. GLONEX, particularly KO, has routinely handled AED's exportations of American elvers from the United States since AED began declaring to the Service in 2012.

As noted in WI Sahakian's 3-

INV #: 2015501394

**Report #: 011** 

332, KO informed WI Sahakian that HUANG owns part of GLONEX, and that KO handles compliance for AED. It is not known how long KO has been helping AED with their eel meat importations. Import documents for this shipment list EZ Logistics LLC. as the brokerage and freight forwarding company for AED not GLONEX).

On November 14, 2016, KO unexpectedly arrived at the Service's Office of Law Enforcement (OLE) in Elizabeth, NJ from Toronto, Canada. During this visit, KO spoke to WI Frances Toledo-Rodriguez and WI Bushman. (See attachment #4; Bushman 3-332).

A summary of important statements made by KO during WI contacts:

- AED owns part of GLONEX.
- HUANG is the President of AED and CP.
- KO has worked for HUANG for five years. KO is the compliance officer for AED. KO
  researches domestic and foreign laws (with the exception of China) to help AED
  shipments adhere to applicable laws.
- KO wanted a contract with HUANG so she would not be associated with him if he did something wrong.
- AED elvers are shipped from Maine, Haiti, and the Dominican Republic to New York and then sent overseas to Hong Kong. The elvers rest in Hong Kong for several days before moving to China where they are raised on farms for one to two years then slaughtered.
- Both AED's elver exports and processed eel meat imports are "Anguilla rostrata". They do not deal in any other species than American eels.
- Some wildlife such as endangered species would need to be declared to the Service but AED's eel meat is not from an endangered species.
- CP has been in operation for over ten years. HUANG built the CP factory. CP was once a small company but is now big enough to buy elvers.
- AED ships elvers directly to ASIA AQUATIC.
- HUANG is a/the agent for "AED TRADING" in Hong Kong.
- CP conducts random DNA testing of their eels to check species.
- CP farms and CP contracted farms are controlled by the Chinese FDA (China Inspection and Quarantine - CIQ). CIQ only lets these farms grow American eels. CP works closely

Page 12 of 16

# REPORT OF INVESTIGATION Title: AMERICAN EEL DEPOT

with the Chinese government. The Chinese government likes CP because they pay a lot of money in taxes.

INV #: 2015501394

**Report #: 011** 

· All eel meat made at CP is exported from China.

# Genetics Examination Report Received from the NWFL

On November 21, 2016, SA Snyder received a Genetics Examination Report from geneticist Dr. Mary Curtis (See attachment #5; Genetics Examination Report). Dr. Curtis's examination revealed that three (3) of the eel filets were identified as *Anguilla rostrata*, the American eel. Dr. Curtis found that eleven (11) of the eel filets were *Anguilla anguilla*, the European eel.

# **Eel Samples Returned from the NWFL**

On December 14, 2016, SA Snyder received all eel samples back from the NWFL.

# **DESCRIPTION OF SUBJECTS**

The following new subjects have been identified:

AED TRADING Hong Kong

## PRIOR VIOLATIONS

A LEMIS query revealed no results for AED TRADING. A LEMIS query showed that subject of SuperCase OPERATION BROKEN GLASS (OBG) under the following INVs:

OBG, INV # 2011400917- See R029, R042 ONEEL FISHERY INC., INV# 2015501226- See R001, R002, R003

Page 13 of 16

Department of the Interior U.S. Fish & Wildlife Service Office of Law Enforcement

Att. B to Gov't Opp - Page 7

# EVIDENCE SUBMITTAL FORM AND EXAMINATION REQUEST

Mail To: National Fish & Wildlife Forensic Lab
1490 East Main Street
Ashland, OR 97520
Ph. 541/482-4191 FAX 541/482-4989
IFST
e-mail: fw9ash\_evidence@fws.gov

		,				
		HE EVIDENCE UNIT AT THE LAI JESTIONS ABOUT COMPLETIN		Lab Case #:		
Case Officer: (Na	ame & Ba	adge #)			Agency:	
SA Amy Snyder 0735					[ ] FWS/LE [ ] State	
Evidence Submitted by: (Name & Badge #) SA LeeAnn Bies 0766				<b>Date:</b> 11/02/2016	[ ] Federal [ ] CITES	
Agency Name, A	ddress:		Suspect Nar	ne(s):	Rec'd in Lab: (Date/By)	
US Fish and W		ervice	-			
1210 Corbin Stree					Logged In: (Date/By)	
Elizabeth, NJ 0720						
(908) 787-1321					Case Assignment:	
ALL CORRESPONDENCE	INCLUDING F	REPORTS, WILL BE MADE TO	Case Title:	AMERICAN EEL DEPOT	TO: T AREA:	
		UNLESS OTHERWISE STATED.				
Item # and Seizure Tag #		escription: re block to describe 1 tag	ged item or the conte	nts of 1 tagged package.	Submission Number:	
Item#: 1	Two (	2) Nine ounce eel	filets Box #0278		Lab #:	
ST #:_851358		160622013500M0				
Item #: 2	Two (	2) Nine ounce eel	filets Box #0151			
ST #: 851358	1 110 (2) 11110 001100 001111010					
Item #: 3	Two (	2) Nine ounce eel	filets Box #0681			
ST #: 851358		160626013500M0				
Item #: 4	Two (	2) Nine ounce eel	filets Box #1026			
ST #: 851358 Lot # 160627013500M05780						
Item #: 5	Two (	2) Ten ounce eel f	ilets Box #1543			
ST #: 851358	,	160627013500M0				
Item #: 6	Two (	2) Ten ounce eel f	ilets Box #1595			
ST#: 851358		160628013500M0				
Additional Items L		back?	Examination or S	hipping Instructions:		
[ ] yes [ ] no		ATTN Mary Co	ATTN Mary Curtis:			
[ ] Case Officer [ ] Submitting Officer		The state of the s	etic testing for specie	es identification.		
Phone:					Attachment # 2	
Return Evidence To:  Agency Address listed above					Attachment #: 2	
Agency Address listed above     Other: see special instructions					Page: 1 of 2	
Additional Instructions on back?						

Rev. Dec/04

# ADDITIONAL SUBMITTED EVIDENCE

Agency Case #: 2015501394		Lab Case #:	
Evidence Submitted by: (Name & Badge #)	Date:	Page: of:	
SA LeeAnn Bies 0766	11/02/2016	2	

Item # and Seizure Tag #	Item Description: Use entire block to describe 1 tagged item or the contents of 1 tagged package.	LAB#:
Item #: 7	Two (2) Six ounce eel filets Box #2015	
ST #:_851358	Lot # 160628013500M0578049	
Item #:		
ST#:		
Item #:		
ST #:		
Item #:		
ST#:		
Item #:		
ST#:		
Item #:		
ST#:		
Item #:		
ST #:		
Item #:		
ST#:		
Item #:		
ST#:		
Item #:		
ST #:		

Additional Examination or Shipping Instructions:

Attachment #: 2

Page: 2 of 2

# RECORD OF INFORMATION THAT MAY BECOME TESTIMONY

INV #: 2015501394 Report #: 3-332 for R011

Title: AMERICAN EEL DEPOT

On 11/10/2016, United States Fish and Wildlife Service (Service) Wildlife Inspector (WI) Daniel Sahakian received a phone call from a person stating to be Ozzy from GLONEX asking about Container YMLU5403825 being held by the Service at East Coast Warehouse. Ozzy asked why the shipment was being held and when it would be released. WI Sahakian informed Ozzy that he did not know of the container and would look into it and find why it was being held.

Upon researching the container WI Sahakian realized the container was being held by Service Special Agent (SA) Amy Snyder for an ongoing investigation. WI Sahakian contacted SA Snyder and Service SA LeeAnn Bies for guidance. The SAs instructed WI Sahakian to ask for documents related to the shipment.

On 11/10/2016, WI Sahakian returned a call to the number provided by Ozzy and spoke with Julie KO. KO was informed that nothing could be found about the shipment and was asked to provide import documents for the shipment.

On 11/10/2016, WI Sahakian called KO and informed her that the initial documentation she sent over by fax were illegible. WI Sahakian asked KO to resend the documents by email and also asked for her to send over any information relating to the species in shipment. KO stated she would look for any documents related to the species and send them over and that the eels were farm raised. KO then emailed WI Sahakian the shipping documents from email address jooyounko@gmail.com, and copied emily@eeldepot.com, and ricky@eeldepot.com (See 11-10-16 email from Julie KO). This phone call was recorded and preserved as "11-10-16 Dan & Ko.MP3".

On 11/14/2016, WI Sahakian sent an email to KO asking again for documents pertaining to species information. (See 11-14-16 email to Julie KO).

On 11/14/2016, WI Sahakian received a call from Ozzy from GLONEX asking for an update on

Location of Observation/Interview: Elizabeth, NJ Office of Law Enforcement

Interview/Observation by: WI Daniel Sahakian

Date: 11/10/2016-11/16/2016

Date Prepared: 3/2/2017

Page 1 of 8

Attachment# 3
Page # 1 of 40

# RECORD OF INFORMATION THAT MAY BECOME TESTIMONY

INV #: 2015501394 Report #: 3-332 for R011

Title: AMERICAN EEL DEPOT

the shipment. Ozzy was informed by WI Sahakian that he had tried to reach KO earlier that morning in an attempt to ask for documents that contained species information pertaining to the shipment in question. Ozzy stated he was unaware but would try and find documents and send them over.

On 11/14/16, KO emailed WI Sahakian and stated that the species would be *Anguila rostrata* and that she would provide documentation as soon as possible (See 11-14-16 email 1 from Julie KO).

On 11/14/16, KO emailed WI Sahakian documents from CHANGLE PACIFIC FOOD CORP. (CP) containing species information related to the container on hold. The documents show the species listed as *Anguilla rostrata* (See 11-14-16 email 2 from Julie KO).

On 11/14/2016, WI Sahakian spoke with KO. KO informed him that she has emailed the documents to him related to the container on hold. KO also stated that the eels are 100% farm raised and United States Department of Agriculture (USDA) approved. KO also stated that the eels are *Anguilla rostrata* and are brought from Haiti to China where they are first raised for one to two years and then cooked. KO mentioned she has never had any problems with the Service on any of their prior shipments.

On 11/15/2016, WI Sahakian received a phone call from KO asking for an update on the container. KO stated she was concerned because this is the first time her shipment has been held and because the shipment has been held for so long, ten days. KO expressed in her words that she was worried "there was something I need to learn in the regulations since I am the compliance officer in the company".

KO explained the eels are raised from babies in the farm next to the factory (CP) for one and a half years. KO continued, the eels are *Anguilla rostrata* and come from either Maine during the two month fishing season, Haiti or the Dominican Republic. KO stated "we do not actually

Location of Observation/Interview: Elizabeth, NJ Office of Law Enforcement

Interview/Observation by: WI Daniel Sahakian

Date: 11/10/2016-11/16/2016

Date Prepared: 3/2/2017

Page 2 of 8

Attachment# 3
Page # 2 of 40

# RECORD OF INFORMATION THAT MAY BECOME TESTIMONY

INV #: 2015501394 Report #: 3-332 for R011

Title: AMERICAN EEL DEPOT

import it[eels] directly, we buy them from Hong Kong". KO said all the eels that she is aware of come from those places.

KO stated that the documents would show eels moving from Haiti to Hong Kong, not Haiti to CP. KO mentioned eels arrive in Hong Kong and stay at a big storage area for a couple days to rest and are then re-exported.

She insisted that she does not touch the eels she just arranges the shipments.

WI Sahakian was informed the

paperwork will have Anguilla rostrata on it.

KO informed WI Sahakian that Ricky HUANG is the president of CP and the AED. KO stated, "He owns part of my company so I am doing the compliance because I am doing the freight forwarding in the United States for a living". She mentioned she ships live eels all over the world but the she works out of the office in Toronto, Canada. KO specified because of her job she studies the laws of the countries which eels are being sent to and teaches them. It is her job to make sure her customers are following the laws and do not get any fines. KO also said since Ricky owns part of her company she is not getting paid even though a majority of her work is to take care of his compliance. KO stated, "we hire the trucking, logistics we hire the Customs Broker, but if anything happens or if they don't know anything what to do then I come in and study the law".

KO said she has studied the laws of Customs, USFWS and the Food and Drug Administration (FDA) and teaches them to follow the laws, it was not clear to WI Sahakian exactly who "them" was referring to. KO stated that she does not work with Chinese law because she does not speak Chinese.

KO stated Ricky was yelling at her because he thought she had missed something, but KO said

Location of Observation/Interview: Elizabeth, NJ Office of Law Enforcement

Interview/Observation by: WI Daniel Sahakian

Date: 11/10/2016-11/16/2016

Date Prepared: 3/2/2017

Page 3 of 8

Attachment# 3
Page # 3 of 40

# RECORD OF INFORMATION THAT MAY BECOME TESTIMONY

INV #: 2015501394 Report #: 3-332 for R011

Title: AMERICAN EEL DEPOT

she went through FWS regulations a couple times and couldn't find anything. KO recounted they are farm raised and they were legal to export from the US, so the shipment is legal. Because of this, KO informed HUANG that this must be a routine check of the shipment. KO then mentioned HUANG did not believe her and that he would continue to vell at her until the shipment was released.

KO stated that some endangered species, live, dead or products must be declared. KO stated she knows this meat does not contain an endangered species so she did not think this shipment would need to be declared. KO asked if there was anything else she needed to know, from what she read the shipment was okay but she wanted to make sure it was good because there are more, much larger shipments coming around Christmas. This conversation was recorded and preserved as "Conversation 1, Julie KO 11\_15\_16.MP3".

WI Sahakian asked KO what the factory does, to which she responded, they grow the eels for one and a half years on a farm next to the their factory and make kabayaki. CP has been in operation for over ten years. CP used to buy baby eels from locals but now they import baby eels themselves. They buy baby eels from Hong Kong and put them in water to grow for 1-2 years on farms. They are then brought to the factory and cooked three times. After that the

Location of Observation/Interview: Elizabeth, NJ Office of Law Enforcement

Interview/Observation by: WI Daniel Sahakian

Date: 11/10/2016-11/16/2016

Date Prepared: 3/2/2017

Page 4 of 8

Attachment# 3
Page # 4 of 40

# RECORD OF INFORMATION THAT MAY BECOME TESTIMONY

INV #: 2015501394 Report #: 3-332 for R011

Title: AMERICAN EEL DEPOT

cooked eels are vacuum packed and exported to countries such as Japan, Korea and North America.

KO informed WI Sahakian that "We work very closely with the FDA, and the CFIA [Canadian Food Inspection Agency] of Canada". She stated they work with the American government for compliance. KO added that the Chinese government does not need all the paperwork that the U.S. requires. KO discussed HUANG, stating their headquarters is in the U.S. HUANG was born in China but is an American citizen and that he likes to show off his American side since it is a big thing in China. KO is Korean and it is a big thing for her to be a Canadian citizen in Korea.

KO stated AED ships

eels directly to Asia Aquatic and "HUANG is agent for AED Trading in Hong Kong". KO explained that the eels must rest in Hong Kong upon arrival for 2-3 days to prevent mortality before they are moved to mainland China. The eels are fragile and small and need a lot of water and oxygen. If they have forty boxes weighing 1,075 kilos, 60 kilos of that weight is live eels. When asked if CP gets their eels elsewhere, KO stated she did not know the China side well but that they have a factory.

KO boasted that "99% of their product is Anguilla rostrata" and that it tastes better and has a better texture. She said other companies use other eels because they are cheaper. KO said she has traveled to see the whole eel process before (at CP). When asked about the other one percent of eels KO mentioned they sometimes buy from contracted farms, but they also have their own farms and that she does not want to guarantee one hundred percent Anguilla rostrata because "you never know what's happening" she said, "But we only deal with Anguilla rostrata". She continued, we have a contract with farmers and we have our own farm and only deal with Anguilla rostrata she said and the contracted farmers are also controlled by Chinese FDA and are only allowed to grow Anguilla rostrata.

Location of Observation/Interview: Elizabeth, NJ Office of Law Enforcement

Interview/Observation by: WI Daniel Sahakian

Date: 11/10/2016-11/16/2016

Date Prepared: 3/2/2017

Page 5 of 8

Attachment# 3
Page # 5 of 40

# RECORD OF INFORMATION THAT MAY BECOME TESTIMONY

INV #: 2015501394 Report #: 3-332 for R011

Title: AMERICAN EEL DEPOT

KO stated that they cannot check each eel one by one, but they do their best and do random DNA checks to check that the eels are Anguilla rostrata "because a lot of things going on".

KO stated the CP factory and AED are owned by HUANG. CP has their own farm next to their factory and they work closely with the Chinese government. KO stated that 100% of what they produce is exported and that CP pays a lot of taxes so the Chinese government likes CP. Ten years ago CP was a small company but now they are big enough to buy baby eels. Huang built the factory in China so that is why they know what they are doing. KO stated she does not have any documents on CP's elver farms because everything is in Chinese and so much time has past.

Inspector Sahakian informed KO that he would look over all the documents. This conversation was recorded and preserved as, "Conversation 2, Julie KO 11 15 16.MP3".

On 11/15/2016, WI Sahakian, sent an email of questions to Ricky HUANG at the email address KO had copied HUANG on in regards to this shipment, Ricky@eeldepot.com. These questions were drafted by Service SAs Snyder and Bies. (See 11-15-16 email to Ricky Huang).

On 11/15/2016, Inspector Sahakian received an email from Ricky Huang answering the questions about the shipment. HUANG stated CP purchases baby *Anguilla rostrata* eels which come from Haiti, Maine or Canada. HUANG claimed that CP oversees the eels as they are raised on farms. When asked if HUANG was familiar with CITES, HUANG stated "Auguilla Rostrata [sic] is not a CITES regulated species at this time". Lastly HUANG stated that CHANGLE PACIFIC only gets eels from farms registered with China Inspection and Quarantine (See 11-15-16 email from Ricky Huang).

On 11/16/2016, after instruction from SAs WI Sahakian emailed KO, Emily Liu, and HUANG to inform them that the shipment would be released (See 11-16-16 email 1 to Julie KO).

Location of Observation/Interview: Elizabeth, NJ Office of Law Enforcement

Interview/Observation by: WI Daniel Sahakian

Date: 11/10/2016-11/16/2016

Date Prepared: 3/2/2017

Page 6 of 8

Attachment# 3
Page # 6 of 40

# RECORD OF INFORMATION THAT MAY BECOME TESTIMONY

INV #: 2015501394 Report #: 3-332 for R011

Title: AMERICAN EEL DEPOT

On 11/16/2016, WI Sahakian released the Container YMLU5403825.

On/ 11/16/16, WI Sahakian sent an email to KO, Liu, and HUANG asking them to please provide species information on import and export shipping documents to help inspectors identify items being shipped. WI Sahakian also informed them about CITES and stated that eels such as *Anguilla anguilla* must have CITES documents and require declaration to the service. WI Sahakian also provided them with a link to the CITES website. KO then sent inspector Sahakian an email where she agreed to provide this information and thanked him for the information (See 11-16-16 email 2 to Julie KO and 11-16-16 email from Julie KO).

### Attachments:

- 1. 11-10-16 email from Julie KO
- 2. 11-14-16 email to Julie KO
- 3. 11-14-16 email 1 from Julie KO
- 4. 11-14-16 email 2 from Julie KO
- 5. 11-15-16 email from Julie KO
- 11-15-16 email to Ricky HUANG
- 7. 11-15-16 email from Ricky HUANG
- 8. 11-16-16 email 1 to Julie KO
- 9. 11-16-16 email 2 to Julie KO
- 10. 11-16-16 email from Julie KO

Location of Observation/Interview: Elizabeth, NJ Office of Law Enforcement

Interview/Observation by: WI Daniel Sahakian

Date: 11/10/2016-11/16/2016

Date Prepared: 3/2/2017

Page 7 of 8

Attachment# 3
Page # 7 of 40



Sahakian, Daniel <daniel\_sahakian@fws.gov>

# Re: American Eel Depot container holding

Julie Ko <jooyounko@gmafl.com>

Thu, Nov 10, 2016 at 12:07 PM

To: daniel\_sahakian@fws.gov

Cc: emily@eeldepot.com, Ricky Huang <ricky@eeldepot.com>

Hello Sir,

I thank you so much for your kind help for our shipment regarding, MBL#YMLUE227007757.

As requested, I enclosed shipping documents as requested.

Plz look into the docs and let me know if there is any thing can be done from our side.

It has been held for a week and we are losing our customer for this.

As mentioned, I will find the doc any docs regarding the species and forward it to you as well.

I once again thank you for your kind help to ths matter.

Best regards,

American Eel depot Julie Ko

<b>(1)</b>	fs280297169.pdf
	896K

Attachment#\_3
Page #\_9 of 40

# 福建省长乐市对外贸易公司

CHANGLE FOREIGN TRADE CORPORATION, FUJIAN, CHINA 57 ZISHENG ROAD, CHANGLE CITY, FUJIAN, CHINA

# 商业发票

# COMMERCIAL INVOICE

INV. NO.: AED2001108 CONTRACT NO.: AED2001108

DD:SEP.18,2016

PAYMENT TERMS: T/T

TO: American Eel Depot Corp.

ADD: 405 MINNISINK RD TOTOWA NJ 07512 USA

TEL: 973-890-8888 FAX: 973-890-8880

1.1.: 9/3-090-0000	FAA: 7/3-030	DATO U	The same of the sa	And in case of the last of the
MARKS:	DESC.:	QTY	UNIT PRC	AMOUNT
唛头	品名	数量	单价	金额
FROZEN ROASTED EEL		KGS	USD CNF	NEW YORK
PROZENIK	6 oz	2000	US\$14.50	US\$29,000.00
	9 oz.	14000	US\$14.50	US\$203,000.00
	10 oz	5000	US\$14.50	US\$72,500.00.
		TTL: 21000KG	S	US\$304,500.00

shipping mark:

NM

CHANGLE FOREIGN TRADE CORPORATION;

Attachment# 3 Page # 11 of 40

# 福建省长乐市对外贸易公司 CHANGLE FOREIGN TRADE CORPORATION, FUJIAN, CHINA 57 ZISHENG ROAD, CHANGLE CITY, FUJIAN, CHINA 装箱单 PACKING LIST

INV. NO.: AED2001108 DD: SEP.18,2016
PORT: FM FUZHOU,CHINA TO NEW YORK,USA

TO: American Eel Depot Corp.

ADD: 405 MINNISINK RD TOTOWA NJ 07512 USA

TEL: 973-890-8888

FAX: 973-890-8880

DESC.	CTNS	G/W	N/W	MEAS.
FROZEN ROASTED EEL	C/T	KG	S	СВМ
6 0Z	200	2300	2000	44.5*34.5*18.5cm
9 az	1400	16100	14000	44.5*34.5*18.5cm
10 oz	500	5750	5000	44.5+34.5*18.5em
TLL:	2100	24150	21000	59.6

shipping mark:

N/M

CHANGLE POREIGN TRADE CORPORATION FULLANCHING

Attachment# 3
Page # 12 of 40

2/3/2017



Sahakian, Daniel <daniel\_sahakian@fws.gov>

# Re: American Eel Depot container holding

Sahakian, Daniel <daniel\_sahakian@fws.gov>
To: Julie Ko <jooyounko@gmail.com>

Mon, Nov 14, 2016 at 9:25 AM

Hello,

Have you been able to get any paperwork about the species from the importer? For the shipment MBL#YMLUE227007757.

Import/ export paperwork needs species information on it somewhere and I do not see any on the information provided. Some species need to be declared to the Fish and Wildlife Service.

Thank you, [Quoted text hidden]

Daniel Sahakian Wildlife Inspector US Fish and Wildlife Service 1210 Corbin St Elizabeth. NJ 07201 Phone:

Fax: 908-787-1334

Attachment# 3
Page # 17 of 40



Sahakian, Daniel <daniel\_sahakian@fws.gov>

# Re: American Eel Depot container holding

Julie Ko <jooyounko@gmail.com>
To: "Sahakian, Daniel" <daniel\_sahakian@fws.gov>

Mon, Nov 14, 2016 at 11:47 AM

Sir,

I thank you for your follow up with this case.

It will be Anguila Rostrata and I will send you the doc as soon as possible.

Thanks and best regards, Julie Ko

[Quoted text hidden]

Attachment# 3
Page # 18 of 40

DEPARTMENT OF THE INTERIOR Mail - Fwd: AED SHIPPING DOCS))



Sahakian, Daniel <daniel\_sahakian@fws.gov>

# Fwd: AED SHIPPING DOCS))

2 messages

Julie Ko <jooyounko@gmail.com>

To: "Sahakian, Daniel" <daniel\_sahakian@fws.gov>

Tue, Nov 15, 2016 at 10:26 AM

Hello Sir.

Plz see the attached shipping doc you requested and let me know anytime if you have any question.

Best regards, Julie Ko

Forwarded message ---

From: "Ozzy - Glonex c/o YS int'l Forwarding" <ozzycho@glonnex.com>

Date: Nov 15, 2016 10:22 AM Subject: AED SHIPPING DOCS)) To: "Julie Ko" <jooyounko@gmail.com>

Cc: "Julie Ko/ GLONEX USA, LTD." <julie.ko@glonnex.com>

Thank you and best regards,

Ozzy Cho / Manager

\*\* GLONEX CANADA \*\*

6334 Viscount Road Mississauga, ON, L4V 1H3, Canada

Tel: 905-676-0013 C.P: 647-987-1542 Fax: 905-676-0274 Vancouver Office: 604-638-8700

Email: ozzycho@glonnex.com Web page: http://www.glonnex.com

\*\* GLONEX USA \*\*

New York Office: 14738 182nd Street Jamaica, NY 11413 USA

Tel: 718-874-2099 Fax: 718-785-2910

SHIPPING DOCS)) AED.pdf

314K

Attachment# 3 Page # 19 of 40

Sahakian, Daniel <daniel sahakian@fws.gov>

Tue, Nov 15, 2016 at 10:44 AM

To: Ryan Bessey <ryan\_bessey@fws.gov>, Amy Snyder <amy\_snyder@fws.gov>, Leeann Bies <leeann\_bies@fws.gov>

https://mail.google.com/mail/u/0/?ul=2&ik=82f643ed91&view=pt&q=julle%20ko&qs=true&search=query&th=158689a0d7d6202d&siml=158689a0d7d6202d&si...



Sahakian, Daniel <daniel sahakian@fws.gov>

# Fwd: CNT#YMLU5403825 BL#E227007757

Julle Ko <jooyounko@gmail.com>
To: daniel\_sahakian@fws.gov

Mon, Nov 14, 2016 at 12:42 PM

Hello, Sir.

Plz see the attached doc as requested.

On the last attachement regarding a ready to eat production file, it shows container information too.

If there is anything else you need, plz let me know.

Best regards, Julie Ko

### 7 attachments

	ment and po	Can		
	Table	-		
200	*****	e		-
ž r			15.72	
-	W-12	-		
200		THE		
Service A	100	-		
215	10.0			7
desir				-
1779 - X	L CALL	ALA.	-	kan i
				-
			W. 100.7	7
Art Care			201-	2.
-	No.	7757	100.7	M
14.	130 364	15.49	107.8	m,

Production Inspection Report-1 美国AED清关资料 AED2001108 YMLU5403825 YMLM908552 20160922 到港日期20161025.jpg 957K



Production Inspection Report-2 美国AED清关资料 AED2001108 YMLU5403825 YMLM908552 20160922 到港日期20161025.jpg 1035K



Production Inspection Report-3 美国AED清关资料 AED2001108 YMLU5403825 YMLM908552 20160922 到港日期20161025.jpg 914K

Attachment# 3
Page # 21 of 40

https://mail.google.com/mail/u/0/?ui=2&ik=82f643ed91&view=pt&q=julle%20ko&search=query&msg=15863f1a75dc0b4b&sImI=15863f1a75dc0b4b

1/2

2/3/2017



List of shipment 美国AED清关资料 AED2001108 YMLU5403825 YMLM908552 20160922 到港日期20161025.jpg



packer letter (Changle pacific food co.,ltd. 美国AED清关资料 AED2001108 YMLU5403825 YMLM908552 20160922 到港日期 20161025.jpg 1369K



Ready to Eat fish product and process Info.JPG 3354K

Processing Flow Chart.pdf 467K

Attachment# 3
Page # 22 of 40

# Changle Pacific

Name of a Frozen Brailed Eci		Health registration		3500/02055				
Species Anguille		Roastrata	Inspection box number and weight of		:	2100Box 21000	KG	
Export country America		Product specifications		907、1002、602				
Narks and N/M		i é	Sample number		10copies/500g (Microorganism In Scopies, Dru residues In 5 copies)			
Packing condition	king Carton packaging, packaging			Date of inspection		16. 6. 19-16. 7. 5		
Inspection item		Test	results					
Date of production	16. 6. 19	16. 6. 22	16. 6. 26	16. 6. 27	,		Judging standard	
Batch / lot	160619013500 /M0578040	160622013500/ M0578043	160626013500/ M0578047	1606270135 M057804				
Varieties	Kabayaki	Kabayaki	Kabayaki	Kabayak	i	Detection method		
The sources of raw materials	3500/N0578	3500/M0578	3500/M0578	3500/NO5	78	- orocrayii isoviiya		
Production quantity / box	184	117	644	645				
The production of weight /KG	1810	1170	6440	6450				
Color	Brown	Brown	Brown	Brown			Brown	
lmpurity	No	No	No	No			No	
Product temperature	—21. 9℃	—22.5℃	-21,4°C	-21.73	С	GB/T21289-2007	18℃	
The appearance of the product	Complete	Complete	Complete	Complet	e		Complete	
Taste and smell	No mud taste	No mud taste	No mild taste	No mud to	ste		No mud taste	
The total number of colonies (cfu/g)	1. 0×10 <sup>4</sup>	1.0×10°	1.5×10 <sup>z</sup>	1.0×10		GB 4789, 2-2010	1. 0×10 <sup>4</sup>	
Coliform bacteriá (MPN/g)	<3	<3	<3	<3		SN/T 0169-2010	<3	
EscherichiaColi	Not detected	Not detected	Not detected	Not deter	ted	SN/T 0169-2010	Not detected	
Stephylococcus aureus	Not detected	Not detected	Not detected	Not detec	ted	GB 4789. LO-2010	Not detected	
Salmonetla	Not detected	Not detected	Not delocted	Not detec	ted	GR 4789, 4-2010	Not desected	
Listeria monocytogenes	Not detected	Not detected	Not detected	Not detec	sted	GB 4789, 30-2010	Not detected	
Bacillus botulinus	Not detected	Not detected	Not detected	Not detec	ted	GB 4789. 10-2010	Not detected	
cholera vibrio	Not detected	Not detected	Not detected	Not detec	cled	SN/T 1022-2010	Not detected	
Vibrio parahaemolyticu s	Not detected	Not detected	Not detected	Not detec	eted	GB/T 4789, 7-2008	Not detected	
mucedine	Not detected	Not detected	Not detected	Not deter	cted	GB 4789, 15-2010	Not detected	
maccartin								

Attachment# 3

https://mail.google.com/mail/u/0/#search/julie+ko/15863f1a75dc0b4b?projector=1



# Sahakian, Daniel <daniel\_sahakian@fws.gov>

# Re: American Eel Depot container holding

Sahakian, Daniel <daniel\_sahakian@fws.gov>
To: Ricky Huang <ricky@eeldepot.com>

Tue, Nov 15, 2016 at 2:27 PM

Mr. Huang,

Julie mentioned that you are the president of American Eel Depot and its factory in China. After speaking with her, I just need a little more information.

- 1. Could you please tell us the species of your baby eels and their countries of origin?
- 2. Does your company oversee the eels throughout their life cycle—harvest, rearing and processing?
- 3. Because certain eel species would need permits under CITES we need to determine what species of eels these are. Are you familiar with CITES (Convention on International Trade in Endangered Species)?
- 4. Where does your factory get their adult eels from?

Thank you in advance for any information you can provide. I look forward to getting this resolved as quickly as possible.

On Thu, Nov 10, 2016 at 12:07 PM, Julie Ko <jooyounko@gmail.com> wrote:

Hello Sir,

I thank you so much for your kind help for our shipment regarding, MBL#YMLUE227007757.

As requested, I enclosed shipping documents as requested.

Plz look into the docs and let me know if there is any thing can be done from our side.

It has been held for a week and we are losing our customer for this.

As mentioned, I will find the doc any docs regarding the species and forward it to you as well,

I once again thank you for your kind help to the matter.

Best regards,

American Eel depot Julie Ko

Attachment#\_3
Page # 34 of 40

https://mail.google.com/mail/u/0/?ui=2&ik=82f643ed91&view=pt&q=julie%20ko&qs=true&search=query&msg=15869759a473d414&dsqt=1&siml=15869759a47... 1/2



Sahakian, Daniel <daniel\_sahakian@fws.gov>

# Re: American Eel Depot container holding

Huang Ricky <ricky@eeldepot.com>
To: "Sahakian, Daniel" <daniel sahakian@fws.gov>

Tue, Nov 15, 2016 at 6:00 PM

Dear Inspector Sahakian,

Thank you very much for your concerned above holding matter

Please see below answer

On November 15, 2016 at 2:27 PM "Sahakian, Daniel" <daniel\_sahakian@fws.gov> wrote:

Mr. Huang,

Julie mentioned that you are the president of American Eel Depot and its factory in China. After speaking with her, I just need a little more information.

1. Could you please tell us the species of your baby eels and their countries of origin?

The China factory(Changle Pacific)purchases baby eel of the species Anguilla Rostrata(American eel).

The origins of the baby eel are Haiti, USA(state of Maine), and Canada

2. Does your company oversee the eels throughout their life cycle—harvest, rearing and processing?

The Factory in China purchases the baby eel(Anguilla Rostrata) and supplies them to farms registered at the China Inspection and Quarantlne(CIQ), the farms grow the eel once the eel are adults, they are transferred to Changle Pacific where they are processed into roasted eel food products. so the Factory (Changle Pacific) does oversee the eel after putting them in the farm to the process.

3. Because certain eel species would need permits under CITES we need to determine what species of eels these are. Are you familiar with CITES (Convention on International Trade in Endangered Species)?

Auguilla Rostrata is not a CITES regulated species at this time

4. Where does your factory get their adult eels from?

The Changle Pacific factory get adult eel only from farms that are registered at the China Inspection and Quarantine(CIQ)

see response to question 2 above

Thank you in advance for any information you can provide. I look forward to getting this resolved as quickly as possible.

Again, Thank you very much for you help!

Attachment# 3
Page # 36 of 40

https://mail.google.com/mail/u/0/?ui=2&ik=82f643ed91&view=pt&q=julie%20ko&qs=true&search=query&msg=1586a3897af64360&sim!=1586a3897af64360

1/2

Ricky Huang

American Eel Depot Corp

On Thu, Nov 10, 2016 at 12:07 PM, Julie Ko <jooyounko@gmail.com> wrote:

Hello Sir,

I thank you so much for your kind help for our shipment regarding, MBL#YMLUE227007757.

As requested, I enclosed shipping documents as requested.

PIz look into the docs and let me know if there is any thing can be done from our side.

It has been held for a week and we are losing our customer for this.

As mentioned, I will find the doc any docs regarding the species and forward it to you as well.

I once again thank you for your kind help to the matter.

Best regards,

American Eel depot Julie Ko

Daniel Sahakian Wildlife Inspector US Fish and Wildlife Service 1210 Corbin St Ellzabeth, NJ 07201 Phone:

Fax: 908-787-1334

Attachment# 3
Page # 37 of 40

2/6/2017



Sahakian, Daniel <daniel\_sahakian@fws.gov>

# Re: American Eel Depot container holding

Sahakian, Daniel <daniel\_sahakian@fws.gov>
To: Julie Ko <jooyounko@gmail.com>
Cc: emily@eeldepot.com, Ricky Huang <ricky@eeldepot.com>

Wed, Nov 16, 2016 at 8:09 AM

Thank you for the information, we have let the warehouse know the shipment is good to go.

Thank you,

On Thu, Nov 10, 2016 at 12:07 PM, Julie Ko <jooyounko@gmail.com> wrote: [Quoted text hidden]

Daniel Sahakian Wildlife Inspector US Fish and Wildlife Service 1210 Corbin St Elizabeth, NJ 07201 Phone: Fax: 908-787-1334

Attachment#\_3
Page #\_38 of 40



# United States Department of the Interior

# FISH AND WILDLIFE SERVICE

Office of Law Enforcement Clark R. Bavin National Fish and Wildlife Forensics Laboratory 1490 East Main Street Ashland, Oregon 97520



November 18, 2016

### GENETICS EXAMINATION REPORT

Agency: USFWS/LE, Elizabeth 1210 Corbin Street Sealand Building 1st Floor Elizabeth, NJ 07201 Lab Case #: 15-0336
Examiner: Burnham Curtis
Agency Case #: 2015501394
Investigator: Snyder

Suspects:

American Eel Depot,

Case Title:

American Eel Depot

### **EVIDENCE RECEIVED:**

The following evidence was received in the Evidence Unit of the Laboratory on November 03, 2016, and was transferred to the undersigned examiner on November 04, 2016:

LAB-4: One of "two (2) nine ounce eel filets Box #0278 Lot#160622013500M0578043" [ST#851358; Item#1]

LAB-5: One of "two (2) nine ounce eel filets Box #0278 Lot#160622013500M0578043" [ST#851358; Item#1]

LAB-6: One of "two (2) nine ounce eel filets Box #0151 Lot#160622013500M0578040" [ST#851358; Item#2]

LAB-7: One of "two (2) nine ounce eel filets Box #0151 Lot#160622013500M0578040" [ST#851358; Item#2]

LAB-8: One of "two (2) nine ounce eel filets Box #0681 Lot#160626013500M0578047" [ST#851358; Item#3]

LAB-9: One of "two (2) nine ounce eel filets Box #0681 Lot#160626013500M0578047" [ST#851358; Item#3]

LAB-10: One of "two (2) nine ounce eel filets Box #1026 Lot#160627013500M0578048" [ST#851358; Item#4]

LAB-11: One of "two (2) nine ounce eel filets Box #1026 Lot#160627013500M0578048" [ST#851358; Item#4]

LAB-12: One of "two (2) ten ounce eel filets Box #1543 Lot#160627013500M0578048" [ST#851358; Item#5]

LAB-13: One of "two (2) ten ounce eel filets Box #1543 Lot#160627013500M0578048" [ST#851358; Item#5]

LAB-14: One of "two (2) ten ounce eel filets Box #1595 Lot#160628013500M0578049" [ST#851358; Item#6]

LAB-15: One of "two (2) ten ounce eel filets Box #1595 Lot#160628013500M0578049" [ST#851358; Item#6]

LAB-16: One of "two (2) six ounce eel filets Box #2015 Lot#160628013500M0578049" [ST#851358; Item#7]

1 of 3

Examiner's Initials:

Attachment #: 5
Page: 1 of 3

Examination Report 15-0336 - Continued November 18, 2016

LAB-17: One of "two (2) six ounce eel filets Box #2015 Lot#160628013500M0578049" [ST#851358; Item#7]

## **EXAMINATION REQUESTED:**

The submitting investigator, Special Agent Amy Snyder, requested analyses to determine the species origin of the evidence represented by LAB-4 through LAB-17.

### **EXAMINATION CONDUCTED:**

A segment of mitochondrial DNA (mtDNA) containing a portion of the Cytochrome *b* (Cyt *b*) gene from LAB-4 through LAB-17 was amplified by PCR and subjected to DNA sequence analysis. The resulting sequences were compared to USFWS National Fish and Wildlife Forensic Laboratory (NFWFL) species reference materials and sequences from the GenBank database.

### **EXAMINATION RESULTS:**

- The Cyt b sequence obtained from LAB-6 and LAB-7 is most similar to that of *Anguilla rostrata* at 391/392 bp (GenBank Acc.#AF485271).
- The Cyt b sequence obtained from LAB-5 is most similar to that of *Anguilla rostrata* at 390/392 bp (GenBank Acc.#AF485271).
- The Cyt b sequence obtained from LAB-4 is most similar to that of *Anguilla anguilla* at 391/392 bp (GenBank Acc#KT633977).
- The Cyt b sequence obtained from LAB-8, LAB-9, LAB-11, LAB-14, LAB-15 is most similar to that of *Anguilla anguilla* at 391/392 bp (GenBank Acc#KT633956).
- The Cyt b sequence obtained from LAB-17 is most similar to that of *Anguilla anguilla* at 390/392 bp (GenBank Acc#KT633956).
- The Cyt b sequence obtained from LAB-13 and LAB-16 is most similar to that of *Anguilla anguilla* at 391/392 bp (GenBank Acc#KT633972).
- The Cyt b sequence obtained from LAB-10 is most similar to that of *Anguilla anguilla* at 390/392 bp (GenBank Acc#KT633972).
- The Cyt b sequence obtained from LAB-12 is most similar to that of *Anguilla anguilla* at 391/392 bp (GenBank Acc#KT633983).

### **EXAMINATION CONCLUSIONS:**

The species origin of LAB-5, LAB-6, and LAB-7 is Anguilla rostrata.

The species origin of LAB-4, LAB-8, LAB-9, LAB-10, LAB-11, LAB-12, LAB-13, LAB-14, LAB-15, LAB-16, and LAB-17 is *Anguilla anguilla*.

### Evidence Summary:

LAB-4, LAB-5 from Box #0278: 1 A. anguilla, 1 A. rostrata

LAB-6, LAB-7 from Box #0151: 2 A. rostrata

LAB-8, LAB-9 from Box #0681: 2 A. anguilla

LAB-10, LAB-11 from Box #1026: 2 A. anguilla

LAB-12, LAB-13 from Box #1543: 2 A. anguilla

LAB-14, LAB-15 from Box #1595: 2 A. anguilla

LAB-16, LAB-17 from Box #2015: 2 A. anguilla

2 of 3

Attachment #: 5
Page: 2 of 3

Examination Report 15-0336 - Continued November 18, 2016

# **DISPOSITION OF EVIDENCE:**

All evidence items were transferred to the Evidence Unit pending return to the submitting agency.

Digitally signed by MARY BURNHAM
CURTS
DN: c=US, 0=U.S. Government,
ou=Department of the Interior, ou=U.S.
Fish and Wildlife Service, cn=MARY
BURNHAM CURTS,
0.9.2342.19200300.100.1.1=140010006644
43
Date: 2016-11-13

Date: 2016.11.18 14:59:05 -08'00' Adobe Acrobat DC version: 2015.020.20039

Mary K. Burnham Curtis, Ph.D. Supervisory Forensic Scientist